

KINGS LAW REPORTS

(ALL SC/NOVEL CA)

(2006) KLR VOL 12 PART 226 pp. 3473 - 3850

DECEMBER 2006

Dedicated to the King of kings

O. O. NOEL ESQ. Chief Editor

INDEX OF CASES REPORTED

1. A-G Bayelsa State v. A-G Rivers State p. 3473
2. Bill Construction Co. Ltd v. Imani & Sons (Nig) Ltd p. 3521
3. Eagle Super Pack (Nig) Ltd v. African Continental Bank p. 3537
4. Ehuwa v. Ondo State Independent Electoral Commission p. 3573
5. Eke v. Ogbonda p. 3613
6. Enekwe v. International Merchant Bank of Nigeria Ltd p. 3645
7. Governor Kwara State v. Ojibara p. 3679
8. Odediran v. State p. 3699
9. Odutola v. Papersack Ltd p. 3703
10. UBA Plc v. BTL Industries Ltd p. 3739
11. Ukpong v. Commissioner For Finance & Economic Development p. 3813

ii INDEX OF SUBJECT MATTER IN (2006) 12 KLR

ACTIONS - Claim - Basis of - It is evident - On the pleadings - That this action is not based on contract - But on the legal effects - Of creation of states (H2) A-G Bayelsa State v. A-G Rivers State p. 3473

ACTIONS - Claim - Creation of States - Committees - Liability of defendant - Determination - Without direct challenge of Afolayan reports - They displace Salihu recommendations - As basis of defendant's liability herein (H7) A-G Bayelsa State v. A-G Rivers State p. 3473

ACTIONS - Claims - Basis - Where plaintiff's claim - Expressed to be based on negligence - Has to be sustained - By reference to a contract - Then the action is based on contract (H4) Eagle Super Pack Ltd v. ACB p. 3537

ACTIONS - Competence - Statute bar - Cause of action - Is the factual situation - Giving a person right to judicial relief - So it can only accrue in contract - Upon breach by defendant (H1) A-G Bayelsa State v. A-G Rivers State p. 3473

ACTIONS - Jurisdiction - Negligence and breach of contract claim - Having nothing to do with marine navigation - Nor monetary policy of the government - State High Court has jurisdiction (H1) UBA Plc v. BTL Industries Ltd p. 3739

ACTIONS - Limitation of - Statute Bar - Banking - Overseas remittance - Respondent's cause of action- To reclaim its unremitted money - Accrued only when it became aware of exhibit C (H2) UBA Plc v. BTL Industries Ltd p. 3739

ACTIONS - Locus standi - Banking - Foreign exchange procurement - Where the Bank failed to procure the agreed foreign exchange - Plaintiff has the locus to sue (H3) UBA Plc v. BTL Industries Ltd p. 3739

APPEALS - Acquiescence - Reply - Where not filed at all - As required by the relevant Rules - Appellants cannot be said to have acquiesced - To what never existed (H7) *Ukpong v. Comm. For Finance & Econ. Dev.* p. 3813

APPEALS - Briefs - Time within which to file - O.6 r.4 Court of Appeal Rules - Time within which to file respondent's brief - Is 45 days from date of service of appellant's brief (H6) *Eke v. Ogbonda* p. 3613

APPEALS - Competence - Issues - Formulation of - Issues for determination - Must be distilled from competent grounds of appeal - Else they are incompetent (H5) *Ehuwa v. Ondo State Inde. Elect. Comm.* p. 3573

APPEALS - Competence - Leave - Tax Authority - S. 26 of the Finance Law - Confers right of appeal to the High Court - On person aggrieved by a decision on tax assessment - And appeal to Court of Appeal should be with leave - Vide s. 221 1979 Constitution (H3) *Ukpong v. Comm. For Finance & Econ. Dev.* p. 3813

APPEALS - Concurrent findings - Based on properly evaluated evidence - Will not be disturbed - As no exceptional circumstance was shown (H5) *UBA Plc v. BTL Industries Ltd* p. 3739

APPEALS - Determination of - During pendency of interlocutory motion - Determination of appeal - Without first determining interlocutory motions - Is breach of fair hearing - Provided the motion is already pending - Which is not the case here (H7) *Eke v. Ogbonda* p. 3613

APPEALS - Ground of appeal - Connection with outcome of appeal - Appeals are not decided - On grounds of appeal - But on issues formulated therefrom (H6) *Enekwe v. Inter. Merchant Bank Ltd* p. 3645

APPEALS - Grounds of appeal - Error in law - Need for appellant to give particulars - Where not complied with - The ground will not be incompetent - If sufficient particulars can be gleaned therefrom (H2) *Ukpong v.*

iv INDEX OF SUBJECT MATTER IN (2006) 12 KLR

Comm. For Finance & Econ. Dev. p. 3813

APPEALS - Grounds of appeal - Preliminary objection against them - Is without foundation - As the grounds are competent and valid (H1) Ukong v. Comm. For Finance & Econ. Dev. p. 3813

APPEALS - Issues - Grounds of appeal - Respondent who has not cross-appealed - Cannot raise issues - Outside those framed by appellant - From the grounds of appeal (H2) Eke v. Ogbonda p. 3613

APPEALS - Issues - Intermediate courts - When an intermediate appellate court - Concludes on one issue - It should generally consider the other issues - Irrespective of effect of issue already decided (H3) Eagle Super Pack Ltd v. ACB p. 3537

APPEALS - Jurisdiction - Right to appeal - Basis of - Appellate jurisdiction - Is created by statute - So no right to appeal - Inures to any person - Except as created by statute (H2) Ehuwa v. Ondo State Inde. Elect. Comm. p. 3573

APPEALS - Leave - Issue of law and jurisdiction - Though can be raised at any stage - It is not a free for all exercise - As some principles should be complied with (H9) Ukong v. Comm. For Finance & Econ. Dev. p. 3813

APPEALS - Leave - New issue - Raised before the Supreme Court - Without leave of court - And is not supported by evidence - Will fail (H6) UBA Plc v. BTL Industries Ltd p. 3739

APPEALS - Preliminary objections - Manner of raising - In raising preliminary objection - Respondent failed to comply with O.2 r.9 Court of Appeal Rules (H1) Eke v. Ogbonda p. 3613

APPEALS - Record of appeal - Effect on Appellate Court - Appellate Court

cannot go outside the record - To raise issues suo motu - As it is bound
- By the record of appeal (H4) Enekwe v. Inter. Merchant Bank Ltd p. 3645

APPEALS - Reply - Finding of appellate High Court - That counter affidavit
is not a reply - Where not appealed against - It remains binding on the
parties (H5) Ukpog v. Comm. For Finance & Econ. Dev. p. 3813

APPEALS - Taxation - Reply - Points of law - Where no reply was filed
by respondent - To appellants' statement of grounds of appeal - Before the
appellate High Court - Respondents' point of law - Cannot be considered
(H12) Ukpog v. Comm. For Finance & Econ. Dev. p. 3813

BANKING - Contracts - Failure of - Foreign exchange - Where appellant
Bank agreed to procure foreign exchange - But failed to do so - Respondent
is entitled to a return of its money (H4) UBA Plc v. BTL Industries Ltd p.
3739

BANKING - Letters of credit - Contract - Exemption clause - Defendant
relying on an exemption clause - Must show that plaintiff - Was aware of
the clause - During formation of the contract (H1) Eagle Super Pack Ltd
v. ACB p. 3537

CONSTITUTIONAL LAW - Amendment of Constitution - Duty of court
- Courts cannot amend the Constitution - Though they may introduce
change - Through interpretation of its words (H1) Governor Kwara State
v. Ojibara p. 3679

CONSTITUTIONAL LAW - Appeals - Murder - Giving effect to the
constitutional provision - Guaranteeing automatic right of appeal to
Supreme Court - Is for court to appoint fresh counsel for appellant (H2)
Odediran v. State p. 3699

CONSTITUTIONAL LAW - Appeals - Murder - Right of appeal to the
Supreme Court - Is automatically guaranteed (H1) Odediran v. State p.

vi INDEX OF SUBJECT MATTER IN (2006) 12 KLR
3699

CONSTITUTIONAL LAW - Creation of states - Out of existing states - Legal effect - Is that such existing state - Ceases to exist - As a judicial entity (H5) A-G Bayelsa State v. A-G Rivers State p. 3473

CONSTITUTIONAL LAW - Fair hearing - Access to the courts - Is granted to every citizen vide s. 33(1) 1979 Constitution - And under the twin pillars - Of the common law concept of natural justice (H1) Bill Constr. Co. Ltd v. Imani & Sons Ltd. p. 3521

CONSTITUTIONAL LAW - Fair hearing - Breach of - Where a party is given ample opportunity - And conducive atmosphere to present his case - But he fails to utilize them - His right to fair hearing is not breached (H4) Bill Constr. Co. Ltd v. Imani & Sons Ltd. p. 3521

CONTRACTS - Agreements - Terms - Subsequent variation of - Written agreement - May be subsequently varied by oral agreement - But such oral agreement - Must be proved in details - By party relying thereon (H2) Odutola v. Papersack Ltd p. 3703

CONTRACTS - Breach - Damages - Essence of - Mitigation - Damages for loss of anticipated profits being too remote - Will be set aside (H7) UBA Plc v. BTL Industries Ltd p. 3739

CONTRACTS - Breach - Ingredients of - To succeed in an action for breach - Plaintiff must prove both existence of contract - And breach by defendant - As done by present plaintiff (H5) Eagle Super Pack Ltd v. ACB p. 3537

CONTRACTS - Damages - Measure of damages - For breach of contract - Is limited to loss - Flowing from the breach - It cannot include general damages (H6) Eagle Super Pack Ltd v. ACB p. 3537

CONTRACTS - Terms - Construction - Duty of Court - Courts interpret agreement - Strictly in its legal content - To give effect to its legal meaning - It is immaterial that the parties were mutually mistaken - As to the legal meaning (H5) *Odutola v. Papersack Ltd* p. 3703

COURTS - Appellate courts - Jurisdiction - Once it is decided - That lower court - Lacked jurisdiction - Appellate Court - Is without jurisdiction - To look into merits of the appeal (H3) *Ehuwa v. Ondo State Inde. Elect. Comm.* p. 3573

COURTS - Issues - As formulated by parties - Binding effect on court - Court is not bound - To take the issues as such - But has a duty to examine the facts - And take issues - That will resolve the matter (H1) *Enekwe v. Inter. Merchant Bank Ltd* p. 3645

CREATION OF STATES - Assets & liabilities - Joint ownership of - Is not prohibited by s. 7(1) of the State Creation Act 1996 - So that defendant's counterclaim - To sole ownership of landed property located outside the old Rivers State - Has no foundation (H6) *A-G Bayelsa State v. A-G Rivers State* p. 3473

DOCUMENTS - Agreements - Binding effect of - Having agreed to joint valuation - Of newly discovered assets - Unilateral valuation is invalid - As parties are bound by their agreement (H9) *A-G Bayelsa State v. A-G Rivers State* p. 3473

ELECTION PETITIONS - Appeals - Local Government Elections - Appeal lies from the Tribunal to the State High Court - Vide s. 94 (2) of the Law - And the High Court's decision is final (H1) *Ehuwa v. Ondo State Inde. Elect. Comm.* p. 3573

ELECTIONS - Electoral commissions - Removal of members - Grounds for - The ground on which the respondents were removed - Is not one of the grounds recognized by the Constitution (H3) *Governor Kwara State v.*

Ojibara p. 3679

ELECTIONS - Electoral commissions - Tenure of members - It is not the intendment of the Constitution - That membership of electoral commissions - Should change with fortunes of political parties (H2) Governor Kwara State v. Ojibara p. 3679

EVIDENCE - Proof - Parties - Burden of proof - Incidence of - Burden of proving particular facts - Falls on the party asserting those facts (H8) A-G Bayelsa State v. A-G Rivers State p. 3473

FAIR HEARING - Breach of - Brief of appeal - Hearing of appeal without respondent's brief - Is not a breach of fair hearing - Where respondent had opportunity to file brief but failed to do so (H4) Eke v. Ogbonda p. 3613

FAIR HEARING - Breach of - Burden of proof - Is on the party who alleges breach - Facts and circumstances of each case - Should be considered (H2) Bill Constr. Co. Ltd v. Imani & Sons Ltd. p. 3521

INJUNCTIONS - Propriety of - Completed act - After an improper removal from office - Where the office is protected by law - Injunctive order could still lie - As such removal is null and void (H4) Governor Kwara State v. Ojibara p. 3679

INTERNATIONAL LAW - Customs or usages - Enforceability - Unless a usage is locally enacted - Or recognized by courts - As generally accepted - Parties relying on it - Must prove submission of the parties to it (H2) Eagle Super Pack Ltd v. ACB p. 3537

JUDGMENTS - Setting aside of - Power of court - Where judgment is a nullity - Superior Court of record have inherent jurisdiction - To set aside its own judgment or order - That is null by a fundamental defect (H3) Eke v. Ogbonda p. 3613

JURISDICTION - Appeals - Leave - Where lower court lacked jurisdiction
- Over some grounds of appeal filed without leave - The other party's
conduct in not objecting - Cannot legally confer jurisdiction (H10) Ukpong
v. Comm. For Finance & Econ. Dev. p. 3813

LANDLAW - Doctrine of Lis pendens - Conditions for application - Object
of suit - Must be to assert title - To a real property - And the suit must be
pending - At time of sale of the property (H3) Enekwe v. Inter. Merchant
Bank Ltd p. 3645

LANDLORD & TENANT - Mesne profits - When appropriate - They
become due to the Landlord - When tenant ceases to hold premises as
tenant - To the time when actual possession is given up (H8) Odutola v.
Papersack Ltd p. 3703

LANDLORD & TENANT - Nature of tenancy - Notice to quit - Surplus
period of notice given by landlord - Or inadequate period accepted by
tenant - Will not change the nature of tenancy - Or the legal requirement
for its period of notice (H7) Odutola v. Papersack Ltd p. 3703

LANDLORD & TENANT - New tenancy - Creation of - Requirements -
Being a bilateral affair - A new tenancy cannot be created - Unless and until
both landlord and tenant are ad idem (H4) Odutola v. Papersack Ltd p. 3703

LANDLORD & TENANT - Tenancy - Creation and conversion of - While
a tenancy at will - Can be converted to a yearly tenancy and vice versa -
In the instant case - It is the yearly tenancy that was converted - To tenancy
at will (H6) Odutola v. Papersack Ltd p. 3703

LANDLORD & TENANT - Tenancy at will - Essence - It is of the essence
of a tenancy at will - That both tenant and landlord - Can terminate the
tenancy - When any of them likes (H1) Odutola v. Papersack Ltd p. 3703

LEASES - Validity - Requirements for - Every lease must be certain - As

to the Property - The Parties and the Term - In order to be valid and enforceable - The oral agreement herein - Failed to satisfy these requirements (H3) *Odutola v. Papersack Ltd* p. 3703

PRACTICE & PROCEDURE - Appeals - Competence - Leave - Appellate jurisdiction of High Court - In Taxation matters from the decision of Tax Authority - Is not destroyed because the appeal before the High Court - Is pursuant to the High Court Rules - As provided by the relevant statute (H4) *Ukpong v. Comm. For Finance & Econ. Dev.* p. 3813

PRACTICE & PROCEDURE - Motions - Fair hearing - Adjournment - Where applicant has finished moving his motion - Grant of application for adjournment to respondent - At that stage on a flimsy reason - Will not be proper (H3) *Bill Constr. Co. Ltd v. Imani & Sons Ltd.* p. 3521

RULES OF COURT - Appeals - O.6 r.10 Court of Appeal Rules - Hearing an appeal without respondent's brief - Procedure for - Appellant need not file any motion on notice - Before hearing could take place (H5) *Eke v. Ogbonda* p. 3613

STATUTES - Interpretation - Principles - Express mention of one thing - Automatically excludes any others - Which would have applied - Otherwise by implication - With regard to the same issue (H4) *Ehuwa v. Ondo State Inde. Elect. Comm.* p. 3573

STATUTES - Interpretation - States Creation Act 1996 s.7(1) - Vests specific assets - On newly created states - But does not vest assets - On States out of which they are created (H4) *A-G Bayelsa State v. A-G Rivers State* p. 3473

STATUTES - Interpretation - Words used in a statute - That are clear and unambiguous - Should be given their ordinary plain meaning (H3) *A-G Bayelsa State v. A-G Rivers State* p. 3473

INDEX OF SUBJECT MATTER IN (2006) 12 KLR xi

TAXATION - Appeals - Leave - Representative action - As there is a common interest - On the issue of 1st respondent's vires - To reassess appellants' taxation - A representative capacity would avail appellants (H8) Ukpong v. Comm. For Finance & Econ. Dev. p. 3813

TAXATION - Appeals - Procedure - Ambiguity - Where the relevant Rules on the nature of reply - Required from the Commissioner in taxation matters - Is not ambiguous - It shall be upheld unto holding - That counter affidavit is not a reply (H6) Ukpong v. Comm. For Finance & Econ. Dev. p. 3813

TAXATION - Assessment - Appeals - Unchallenged finding that 1st respondent lacks vires - For the assessment of taxes - Makes lower court's going into other issues unnecessary (H11) Ukpong v. Comm. For Finance & Econ. Dev. p. 3813

WORDS & PHRASES - Arguable point - Purport - To say a point is arguable - Does not show ones stand on the point - The stand can only be seen - From the final order - Made on the point (H5) Enekwe v. Inter. Merchant Bank Ltd p. 3645

WORDS & PHRASES - Lis Pendens - Meaning - It is a caveat giving notice - That a particular property - Is the res of a lawsuit - Hence any interest acquired in it - Will be subject to the outcome of the suit (H2) Enekwe v. Inter. Merchant Bank Ltd p. 3645

INDEX OF STATUTES & RULES

Arbitration and Conciliation Act cap. 19 LFN 1990 ss. 31, 29(1)(a) Bill Constr. Co. Ltd v. Imani & Sons Ltd. p. 3521

Constitution of Nigeria 1979 s. 33(1) Bill Constr. Co. Ltd v. Imani & Sons Ltd. p. 3521; s. 221(1) Ukpong v. Comm. For Finance & Econ. Dev. p. 3813; s. 33(1) Eke v. Ogbonda p. 3613

Constitution of the Federal Republic of Nigeria 1999 s. 251(1)(d) UBA Plc

xii INDEX OF STATUTES & RULES IN (2006) 12 KLR

- v. BTL Industries Ltd p. 3739; ss. 197, 199, 201, 205 Governor Kwara State v. Ojibara p. 3679; ss. 7, 240, 241, and 246 Ehuwa v. Ondo State Inde. Elect. Comm. p. 3573
- Court of Appeal Act s.16 Enekwe v. Inter. Merchant Bank Ltd p. 3645
- Court of Appeal Rules, O.3, r. 23 Enekwe v. Inter. Merchant Bank Ltd p. 3645; O.6, r.3, 4, 10; O.2, r.9 Eke v. Ogbonda p. 3613
- Decree No. 107 1993 s. 230(1) UBA Plc v. BTL Industries Ltd p. 3739
- Evidence Act, L. F. N 1990, s.74 Eagle Super Pack Ltd v. ACB p. 3537; s. 135 A-G Bayelsa State v. A-G Rivers State p. 3473
- Finance Law (Appeals) High Court Rules of Cross River State, rr. 6(1), 8, 9(1) and 26 Ukpong v. Comm. For Finance & Econ. Dev. p. 3813
- Finance Law of Cross River State s. 26 Ukpong v. Comm. For Finance & Econ. Dev. p. 3813
- High Court Laws of Eastern Nigeria, s.15 A-G Bayelsa State v. A-G Rivers State p. 3473
- High Court of Lagos Civil Procedure Rules O. 49 r. 4 Bill Constr. Co. Ltd v. Imani & Sons Ltd. p. 3521
- High Court of Plateau State (Civil Procedure) Rules O. 8 r. 7 Enekwe v. Inter. Merchant Bank Ltd p. 3645
- Limitation Law of Rivers State, 1988 A-G Bayelsa State v. A-G Rivers State p. 3473
- Local Government Administration, Conduct of Local Government Election and Allied Matters Law 2003 of Ondo State s.94(2) Ehuwa v. Ondo State Inde. Elect. Comm. p. 3573
- Personal Income Tax Decree No. 104, 1993 s. 26, 57 and 60 Ukpong v. Comm. For Finance & Econ. Dev. p. 3813
- Rent Control and Recovery of Premises Law, Cap. 167, Laws of Lagos State; ss. 14 (1) (a), 15 (1) Odutola v. Papersack Ltd p. 3703
- States (Creation and Transitional Provision) Decree No 36, 1996, s. 7 A-G Bayelsa State v. A-G Rivers State p. 3473
- Statute of Limitation Act, 1623 A-G Bayelsa State v. A-G Rivers State p. 3473
- Supreme Court Rules O. 2 r. 9 Eke v. Ogbonda p. 3613